What’s the Truth about… Making Berachot after Kiddush?

By Ari Z. Zivotofsky

M

isconception: After drinking wine at a Kiddush, one is required to make a separate berachah (blessing) over soda and other liquids.

Fact: Assuming one drank some wine or grape juice, the borei peri hagafen recited over it exempts all other drinks with which it is mixed, regardless of the order in which they are consumed.

Background: Over the centuries, rabbinic authorities have wrestled with the question of whether the wine recited over fish and that will subsequently be drunk over fish and orange juice can also cover soups, even those made with grape juice.

The uniqueness of bread and wine is noted in the Gemara (Rav Chiya taught (Berachot 41a): “The blessing on bread exempts all other foods, and the blessing on wine exempts all other drinks.” Tosafot (ibid, s.v. ehyeh halach) explains that the reason behind this halachah is that wine, when present, is considered the main drink, and all other drinks are subordinate to it. However, Rav Chiya’s ruling, however, was not universally accepted. Tosafot (ibid, s.v. vegah) creates a distinction between this halachah (Berachot 41a) and Berachot (41b) that “The blessing on bread exempt all other foods, and the blessing on wine exempts all other drinks.” Tosafot (ibid, s.v. vegah) explains that the reason behind this halachah is that wine, when present, is considered the main drink, and all other drinks are subordinate to it. Rav Chiya’s ruling, however, was not universally accepted. Tosafot (ibid, s.v. vegah) creates a distinction between this halachah (Berachot 41a) and Berachot (41b) that “The blessing on bread exempt all other foods, and the blessing on wine exempts all other drinks.”

Rabbi Dr. Zivotofsky is on the faculty of the Brain Science Program at Bar-Ilan University in Israel.

That even after one has recited hagafen, if another brand of wine is brought out, one may have to recite another berachah, hatevah me’hamevi. The proposal that a change of brand warrants an additional berachah was soundly rejected. The recital of hatevah me’hamevi is based on the fact that wine “causes God and people to rejoice.”

1. There may be other exceptions. For example, some authorities rule that tomato juice requires a borei peri hagaden. However, unlike the blessing of hagaden which is recited only over bread, hagaden is recited over all liquids.

2. Zohar, Balak 189b based on Proverbs 9:5.


4. See Beit Yosef to OC 175.

5. See Berachot 35b and Shulchan Aruch OC 175:4.

6. For a discussion of this halachah see Torah Loda’at 4:103 and Yechave D’at 5:20.

7. The Aruch HaShulchan, while arguing that the halachah should not follow Rav Chiya, acknowledges that others have ruled that wine exempts other drinks and when one drinks them afterwards, one is lenient; hence, there is no need to make further berachot.

8. Alexander Aryeh Mandelbaum, Ve’ot Hahabadalah, 5760, pp. 267-9, discusses whether this rule applies as well to grape juice. On pages 59 and 267, he notes Rav Elyashiv (whom he regards as “one of the greatest halahador” throughout the sifrei without using his actual name) who questions whether or not this rule applies to grape juice, and who therefore concludes that one should act stringently by including any new liquids in a berachah one recites over solid food (e.g. make a shahalk over fish and that will cover the orange juice one plans to drink as well). Rav Y. P. Bodner (Sefar V’Ten Berachot [The Haladot of Berachot], 1989, p. 99) opines that concerning this halachah, grape juice and wine are equivalent. The presiding custodes seems to be not to differentiate between wine and grape juice.

Hagafen can also cover soups, even those that require the blessing of hasedarmah such as vegetable soups (see Rav Chaim Kanievsky (quoted in Tzohar, [Rav Elyashiv D’works, editor] vol. 5 (5759), pp. 117-118). The Kitzot HaShulchan (Badei haShulchan 53:28) questions whether hasidarmah soups can be covered by the hagafen, since their berachot indicate that they are halachically regarded as vegetables and not drinks. However, eating many others rule that wine does exempt other drinks.

9. Rambam or the Tur and suggests that Rav Chaya’s ruling, however, was not universally accepted. Tosafot (ibid, s.v. vegah) creates a distinction between this halachah (Berachot 41a) and Berachot (41b) that “The blessing on bread exempt all other foods, and the blessing on wine exempts all other drinks.”

10. See Rav Chaim Kanievsky (quoted in Tzohar, [Rav Elyashiv D’works, editor] vol. 5 (5759), pp. 117-118). The Kitzot HaShulchan (Badei haShulchan 53:28) questions whether hasidarmah soups can be covered by the hagafen, since their berachot indicate that they are halachically regarded as vegetables and not drinks. However, eating many others rule that wine does exempt other drinks.

11. See all of chapter 10, page 367-399 (397-399) on this topic. The Kitzur Shulchan Aruch (494:6) rules that for hagafen, one has in mind to drink other liquids or other liquids are in front of him, then he is certainly not required to make a new berachah.


14. See Birke Yosef 175:1 cited in Kitzot Chaim 175.2.

15. M. Ishnah Berurah 174:3; Shut Shemot Chaim 5751, pp. 100. M. Ishnah has a comprehensive analysis of this halachah on pages 264-267 and 294-296.

16. See Yalkut Yosef, Shut HaChaim 1752.

17. M. Ishnah Berurah 174:3; Shut Chatam Sofer OC 47.

18. Ironically, it is the Aruch HaShulchan OC 175:3, who concludes that merely hearing Kiddush possibly suffices.

19. It is questionable if an sip is sufficient or if an entire melo lumanv (closely): about 1.7 fl. oz. is required. See Birur HaShulchan 174:2; Sha’ar Hametzuyin 174:9; Yechave D’at 5:20; Shulchan Aruch Harad 174:4 and M. Ishnah Yitzchak 174:9. Rav Chaim Kanievsky (quoted in Tzohar, [Rav Elyashiv D’works, editor] vol. 5 (5759), pp. 117-118) observes that the mingah is to be lenient and even a sip suffices to exempt other drinks. Rav Ovadia Yosaf rules similarly (See Badei haShulchan OC 175:1; 5, 5751, p. 166). (There are those who suggest that in order to satisfy halachic opinions, a berachah should be recited on another food item, e.g. making a shahalk on fish and then drinking the soda.) The hagafen exempts even if one only takes a sip of the grape juice and his sole intention is to exempt future drinks. This is unlike hagafen which does not cover other foods unless the bread is truly the staple and at least a keriyat is eaten (see Igarot M oshe O. 4:41).