

What's the Truth about... Making *Berachot* after *Kiddush*?

By Ari Z. Zivotofsky

Misconception: After drinking wine at a *kiddush*, one is required to make a separate *berachah* (blessing) over soda and other liquids.

Fact: Assuming one drank some wine or grape juice, the *borei peri hagafen* recited over it exempts all drinks within the collation, much the same way that *hamotzi* covers other foods.

Background: Over the centuries, rabbinic authorities have wrestled with this *halachah* and reached varied conclusions. A sampling of the opinions will be cited, but emphasis will be given to the majority opinion as found in the *Shulchan Aruch*, *Mishnah Berurah*, and contemporary *posekim*.

Unlike most other fruit juices over which a *shehakol* is said,¹ wine has a special status and hence merits its own *berachah* (*Mishnah*, *Berachot* 6:1). In this sense, wine is similar to bread, which, unlike all other grain products, merits the *berachah* of *hamotzi*. This is partly because bread and wine are considered among the main “foods of sustenance” (see e.g. *Eichah* 2:12 and *Bava Batra* 90b) as well as the “principle components of a meal.”² Wine, however, has a further distinction in

that even after one has recited *hagafen*, if another brand of wine is brought out, one may have to recite another *berachah*, *hatov vehameitiv*.³ (The proposal that a change of bread warrants an additional *berachah* was soundly rejected.)⁴ The recital of *hatov vehameitiv* is based on the fact that wine “causes God and people to rejoice.”⁵

The uniqueness of bread and wine is noted in the Gemara; Rav Chiya taught (*Berachot* 41b) that “[The blessing on] bread exempts all other foods, and [the blessing on] wine exempts all other drinks.” Tosafot (*ibid*, s.v. *ey hachit*) explains that the reason behind this *halachah* is that wine, when present, is considered the main drink, and all other drinks are subordinate to it. Rav Chiya’s ruling, however, was not universally accepted.⁶ Tosafot (*ibid*, s.v. *veyayin*, cf *Tosafot Berachot* 42a) rules against Rav Chiya. Moreover, the *Aruch Hashulchan* (*OC* 174:3) notes that this *halachah* is not found in the Rambam or the Tur and suggests that it was appropriate for them to omit it because, according to his understanding, the Gemara rejects Rav Chiya’s ruling.⁷ Thus, according to Tosafot, Rambam and the Tur, the *hagafen* recited over wine has no bearing on subsequent drinks.

However, Rosh, Rabbeinu Yonah,

Ohr Zarua, Ra’avad, Rashba, Ritva and many others rule that wine does exempt other drinks. The *halachah* as decided in the *Shulchan Aruch* and *Rema* (*OC* 174:2) is that the *berachot* recited before and after wine suffice for all other liquids drunk during that repast.⁸ There is also a minority view that if the wine is drunk purely for sacramental purposes and not because the person desires to drink it, such as often occurs with *Kiddush*, it does not exempt subsequent drinks.⁹ However, the *Mishnah Berurah* (174:39) and *Shulchan Aruch Harav* (174:4) disagree with this approach. In light of the principle of *safek berachot lehakel* (when in doubt regarding *berachot*, we rule leniently and do not recite the *berachah*), it would seem that the *halachah* should follow the opinion that even “sacramental” wine exempts other liquids. Certainly having in mind to exempt other beverages while drinking “sacramental wine” would—according to most authorities—absolve one from having to make future *berachot*.¹⁰

According to many authorities, in order for the *hagafen* to cover other liquids, they must be present at the time the *berachah* is recited. However, significant decisors reject this condition.¹¹ Almost all,¹² however, agree that it is necessary to drink some of the wine (*Mishnah Berurah* 174:3)¹³

and merely listening to someone else recite *Kiddush*, while fulfilling the *Kiddush* obligation, does not suffice to exempt future drinks. According to some opinions, as long as one does not make a conscious decision to stop drinking wine, he is exempt from making any further *berachot*. Others say that all that is necessary is that some wine remain available.¹⁴

Thus, in most cases when a person makes *Kiddush* and drinks some of the wine, there is no need to make further *berachot* on water, soda, orange juice or apple juice that are subsequently drunk. It would even seem that if one *bentched* over a cup of wine,¹⁵ drank the wine and then wanted to drink coffee there would be no need to recite a *shehakol*.¹⁶

Similarly, the concluding blessing for wine—*meiein shalosh* (“*al hagafen*”)—covers the other drinks.¹⁷ Most people are unaware of the significance of *hagafen* and thus, may end up making unnecessary *berachot*.

Notes

1. There may be other exceptions. For example, some authorities rule that tomato juice requires a *borei peri ha'adamah*. However, unlike the blessing of *hagafen* which is recited only over wine, *ha'admah* is recited over all vegetables.

2. *Zohar*, *Balak* 189b based on *Proverbs* 9:5.

3. *Yerushalmi Berachot* 6:8; *Bavli Berachot* 59b and *Pesachim* 101a; *Shulchan Aruch OC* 175:1-6.

4. See *Beit Yosef* to *OC* 175.

5. See *Berachot* 35b and *Shulchan Aruch Harav OC* 175:1.

6. For a discussion of this *halachah* see *Torah Loda'at* 4:103 and *Yechava Da'at* 5:20.

7. The *Aruch Hashulchan*, while arguing that the *halachah* should not follow Rav Chiya, acknowledges that others have ruled that wine exempts other drinks and when faced with a rabbinic doubt, we are lenient; in the previous paragraph, he lays out his opinion of when the rule applies.

8. Alexander Aryeh Mandelbaum,

Vezot Haberachah, 5760, p. 267-9, discusses whether this rule applies as well to grape juice. On pages 99 and 267, he quotes Rav Elyashiv (whom he refers to as “one of the *gedolei hador*” throughout the *sefer* without using his actual name) who questions whether or not this rule applies to grape juice, and who therefore concludes that one should act stringently by including any new liquids in a *berachah* one recites over solid food (e.g. make a *shehakol* over fish and that will cover the orange juice one plans to drink as well). Rav Y. P. Bodner (*Sefer V'ten Berachah* [*The Halachot of Berachot*], 1989, p. 99) opines that concerning this *halachah*, grape juice and wine are equivalent. The prevalent custom seems to be not to differentiate between wine and grape juice.

Hagafen can also cover soups, even those that require the blessing of *ha'adamah* such as vegetable soups (Rav Chaim Kanievsky, quoted in *Tzohar*, [Rav Elyakim Dvorkes, editor] vol. 5 (5759), pp. 117-118). The *Ketzot HaShulchan* (*Badei Hashulchan* 53:28) questions whether *ha'adamah* soups can be covered by the *hagafen* since their *berachah* indicates that they are *halachically* regarded as vegetables and not drinks. However, “watery” foods such as leben and yogurt can be included and according to Rav Elyashiv, even solidified liquid like ice cream and sour cream (Mandelbaum, p. 100). Mandelbaum has a comprehensive analysis of this *halachah* on pages 264-267 and 294-296.

9. See *Chayei Adam* 55:6 with *Nishmat Adam* 55:1 and *Shut Kol Eliyahu* 2:OC:7.

10. See *Birkei Yosef* 175:1 cited in *Kaf HaChaim* 175:2.

11. *Mishnah Berurah* 174:3; cf *Shut Chatam Sofer OC*:47.

12. Ironically, it is the *Aruch Hashulchan OC* 174:3, who concludes that merely hearing *Kiddush* possibly suffices.

13. It is questionable if a sip is sufficient or if an entire *melo lugmav* (cheekful—about 1.7 fl. oz.) is required. See *Biur Halachah* 174:2; *Sha'ar Hatziyun* 174:9; *Yechava Da'at*

5:20; *Shulchan Aruch Harav* 174:4 and *Minchat Yitzchak* 8:19. Rav Chaim Kanievsky (quoted in *Tzohar*, [Rav Elyakim Dvorkes, ed.] vol. 5 (5759), pp. 117-118) observes that the *minhag* is to be lenient and even a sip suffices to exempt other drinks. Rav Ovadia Yosef rules similarly (See Rabbi Yitzchak Yosef, *Yalkut Yosef*, vol. 3, 5751, p. 166). (There are those who suggest that in order to satisfy all halachic opinions, a *berachah* should be recited on another food item, e.g. making a *shehakol* on fish and then drinking the soda.) The *hagafen* exempts even if one only takes a sip of the grape juice and his sole intention is to exempt future drinks. This is unlike *hamotzi* which does not cover other foods unless the bread is truly the staple and at least a *kezayit* is eaten (see *Iggerot Moshe OC* 4:41).

14. Rabbi Moshe Levi, *Sefer Birchat Hashem* (5760), vol. 3, pp. 389-394 (notes 311-312). See all of chapter 10, section 6 (pages 387-399) on this topic. The *Kitzur Shulchan Aruch* (49:4-6) rules that if while reciting *hagafen*, one has in mind to drink other liquids or other liquids are in front of him, then he is certainly not required to make a new *berachah*.

15. See “Legal-ease: What’s the Truth about ... *Birkat Hamazon* over Wine?” *Jewish Action*, winter 2000, 62-3.

16. See *Ginat Veradim* (Rav Avraham Halevi, Egypt, 17th century, reprinted 5751), *OC* 1:1 who says this explicitly after a long discussion of this topic. See also *Yalkut Yosef*, *ibid*, p. 171.

17. This only applies when the wine was drunk first. If a person first drinks water or other liquids and then wine (a situation which obviously cannot occur with *Kiddush* because it is prohibited to eat or drink anything—even water—between *davening* and *Kiddush*, *Aruch Hashulchan OC* 289:4), most authorities would require that a *borei nefashot* and an *al hagafen* be said (see Rav Moshe Levi, *ibid*, pp. 397-399, notes 325-327 who cites *Shiltei Giborim* and the *Mordechai*). 